

GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, December 5, 2017

4:00 p.m.

German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent, it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. If you have any questions, please call the city's Historic Preservation Office staff at 614-645-0664.

If you need assistance in participating in this meeting due to a disability under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206 at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 PM (NOON), Wednesday, December 27, 2017 -50 WEST GAY STREET (BEACON BUILDING)
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., **Wednesday, January 3, 2018**
German Village Meeting Haus, 588 S. Third Street
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Wednesday, November 8, 2017
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **17-12-16** (*not required to attend*)

100-104 Nursery Lane

Elizabeth A. Allen (Applicant/Owner)

An application and photographs have been submitted. House was originally a one-family dwelling and is being returned to a one-family dwelling.

Remove Non-Original Door Opening

- Remove the existing, non-original door and infill the non-original door opening on the facade that currently provides access to the second floor unit.
- Install new siding, on first floor façade to cover the non-original door opening.
- New siding to match profile of the existing wood siding.



IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:05 P.M.

2. 17-12-18

804 City Park Avenue

Nelson Heinrichs & Janay Oakland (Applicant)

Nelson Heinrichs (Owner)

An application and photographs have been submitted. A new, garage door was installed prior to review and approval. A code order has been issued. Garage was built about 1992.

Retain Existing Door

- Retain the two (2) existing, steel overhead garage doors, as installed.
- Existing doors replace deteriorated and damaged wood damaged doors.

3. 17-12-19a

710 South Pearl Street

Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

Terry & Shelly Kelley (Owner)

Application #17-12-19 has been divided into item 'a' for German Village Commission review under Staff Recommendations, and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items (see below).

An application, landscape plan, and photographs have been submitted.

Landscape/Hardscape

- Install a 12" high limestone retaining edge on the south side of the front stoop, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawing.
- Install a 6' high gate, with a brick pier with stone cap, on the south side of the property, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawing. Gate to be painted wood.
- Install a raised, bluestone courtyard with fireplace and water feature in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted site plan and plantings list.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:20 P.M.

4. 17-12-20

579 South Grant Avenue

Ben Ahrens (Applicant/Owner)

An application, slate assessment, and photographs have been submitted.

Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all slate on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

CertainTeed

Carriage House (dimensional)

Stonegate Gray

GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

English Gray Slate

Weathered Slate

Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

Nickel Gray

GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

Nickel Gray

Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) Estate Gray

Tamko (standard 3-tab) Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

5. **17-12-21** (*not required to attend*)

343 East Livingston Street

Othelda A. Spencer (Applicant/Owner)

An application and photographs have been submitted. HPO Staff has conducted a site visit .

Install New Windows

- Remove the two (2) deteriorated, wood, 2/2 double-hung sash windows on the second story, rear elevation of the brick dwelling.
- Remove the two (2) deteriorated, wood, 2/2 double-hung sash windows on the second story, front elevation of the brick dwelling.
- Install a total of four (4) new, all wood (interior/exterior), simulated-divided-lite (SDL), 2/2 double-hung sash windows in the same locations.
- New windows to fit the historic window openings.
- Cut sheet for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation of new windows.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

6. **17-11-29a** (*not attending*)

503 South Third Street

Jon Halverstadt (Applicant/Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed September 5, 2017 and continued from the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing. Applicant requests to be continued to the January 3, 2018 GVC agenda.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, ca. 1935, frame and concrete block garage.

Construct New Garage

- Construct a new, detached, garage.
- Shift existing curb cut along E. Blenkner Street.
- Remove existing curb cut and concrete driveway along S. Third Street.
- Future patio and green space on north side of existing house to return for review.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:30 P.M.

7. 17-11-38a

399 East Livingston Avenue

Northstar Realty c/o Jack Reynolds, attny. (Applicant)

Education First Credit Union (Owner)

A clearance bar, order & menu boards, rear elevation "Starbucks" signage, an Exit Only/Thank You sign at the east drive, and bollards were approved at the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing. The two (2) "Drive Thru" signs and the one (1) Starbucks pole sign were continued. Revised drawings have been submitted.

Directional Signage/West Drive

- Install one (1) directional, "Drive Thru" sign on each side of the existing driveway on the north/Livingston Avenue side of the brick piers (2 total), per the submitted drawings.
- Aluminum panels to include the green and white Starbucks logo on black background.
- Each sign to measure 12" wide and 18" high (1.5 s.f.).
- Install one (1) chevron arrow sign on the inside of each brick pier (2 total), per the submitted drawings.
- Aluminum panels to include white arrows on black background.
- Each sign to measure 12" wide and 18" high (1.5 s.f.).

Pole Sign

- Install one (1) freestanding pole, not to exceed 15' tall, with/hanging 3'4" diameter logo disk, per the submitted drawing (8.76 s.f.)
- Sign to be externally illuminated.

The following is from the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing:

Commissioner Comments:

- *The drive-thru signs need to be designed to work with the existing brick piers, or remove the existing brick piers and have free-standing signs.*
- *Starbucks logos on the drive-thru signs would make it more clear to drivers exactly where the Starbucks entrance is located.*
- *The existing fence along the front could possibly be removed if some other consistent, urban street front treatment is used to mark the front yard.*
- *The proposed Starbucks pole sign should be a consistent height with the existing pole sign.*

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:45 P.M.

8. 17-11-39

900 South Third Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Sue Fauber (Owner)

This application was continued from the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing. An application and revised drawings have been submitted. Applicant seeks final approval.

Modify Existing Roof

- Modify the existing, non-original roof form, per the submitted drawings.
- Roofing to be from the approved roofing shingles list.
- New, one-over-one, wood windows to match existing windows.
- Roof pitch to match main roof.
- Eave detail to match main roof.

New Exterior Stairway

- Remove the existing, exterior, metal stairway.
- Install new, metal, exterior stairs for second-floor egress in the commercial building.
- Railings to include ½" square tube balusters and 1" square top and bottom rails.
- Closed risers and treads to be wood.

The following is from the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing:

Commissioner Comments:

- *The proposed alterations appear to be an improvement to existing conditions.*
- *There seems to be no way around the exterior stairs without a massive addition.*
- *Increasing the height of the existing addition will cover more historic brick on the principle structure that is visible from Whittier Street.*
- *The proposed wood stair will be visually heavier than the existing metal stairs.*
- *Need staff site visit to determine the date/era of construction of the existing addition.*

NEW APPLICATIONS

9. 17-12-23

1046 Jaeger Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Brittany Fortin (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing. Existing rear addition was approved in 1998. Applicant seeks final approval.

New Addition

- Construct a new, second-story addition above the existing, ca. 1998, one-story, frame addition, per the submitted drawings.
- New wood siding to match existing main structure on north, east, and south elevations.
- Wood windows to be 2/2 double-hung sash.
- Roofing shingles to match existing shingles on main roof.
- Extend existing chimney on rear elevation.

Modify Existing South Elevation Entry

- Modify the entry porch on the south elevation, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior siding to be bead board and wood panels.
- Entry door to be full-lite.

The following is from the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing:

Commissioner Ferriell:

- *Initially concerned about the massing, but after looking at other houses on the same stretch, does not see a lot of difference from other houses in the area.*

Commissioner Thiell:

- *Asked about the construction of the chimney.*

Commissioner McCoy:

- *The proposal looks fine conceptually.*

Commissioner Durst:

- *Noted that the proposal essentially extends the second floor out, brings the rear addition up, and gets them to meet to fill in the existing gaps.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:00 P.M.

10. 17-12-8a

175 East Deshler Avenue

Kimberlee Reed/Able Roof (Applicant)

Larry Little (Owner)

Application #17-12-8 has been divided into item 'a' for German Village Commission review under New Applications, and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items (see below). An application and photos have been submitted.

Remove Box Gutter

- Remove the box gutter on the small, shed roofed section on the rear of the building, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, 6" half-round gutter and tie into existing downspout.

11. 17-12-24

207 East Deshler Avenue

Ziad Shaheen (Applicant/Owner)

Installation of a new fence was staff approved June 20, 2016. A single-sided fence was constructed with stringers facing neighboring property. Applicant returned to GVC on May 2, 2017. The Application was continued. Applicant worked with staff to design an appropriate modification of the 199 E. Deshler side of the fence. The modification was completed in August 2017, with final color to be submitted for approval.

Fence Paint Color

- Apply final paint/stain color to the north side of the existing fence, per the submitted color examples.
- Existing concrete posts to remain unpainted, as is.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:25 P.M.

12. 17-12-22a

538 South Sixth Street

Steven R. Maravich, ASLA (Applicant)

Michele Holcomb (Owner)

Application #17-12-22 has been divided into item 'a' for German Village Commission review under New Applications, and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items (see below). An application, landscape plan, and photographs have been submitted.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove all existing, 6' high, board-on-board, privacy fence along the north and south sides of the rear yard.
- Install new, horizontal, wood privacy fence along the south side of the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new, horizontal, wood privacy fence along north side of rear yard.
- Install two (2) horizontal panels above the existing, two (2) sections of brick wall along the south rear yard, facing onto Blenkner Street.
- Install new, horizontal gate on south side of rear yard, in same location as the existing wrought iron gate.
- Install new fence shutters between the two (2) existing sections of brick wall along the south side of the rear yard.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:40 P.M.

13. 17-12-25

228 East Beck Street

City of Columbus Recreation and Parks Dept. & German Village Garten Club (Applicants)

City of Columbus (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed on November 8, 2017. Revised drawings have been submitted. Applicant seeks final review.

Build New Pergola

- Remove the existing, ca. 2002 pergola, per the submitted photographs.
- Build new pergola structure on an existing, concrete pad, with expanded footprint, per the submitted renderings.
- Roof system to be metal, snap-on-seam SS10. Color to be “Dove Grey.”
- Ceiling system to be wood.

The following is from the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing:

Commissioner McCoy:

- *No objections to the look of the proposed pergola. Would like some clarification on how the structure works with the cantilevered corner.*
- *The standing-seam-metal roof is consistent with the existing house behind it.*

Commissioner Durst:

- *Wonders if the level of noise that rain on the roof would cause during a performance has been considered.*
- *Will need details on the light fixture.*

Commissioner Thiell:

- *Will need to have more detailed drawings showing how the parts and pieces will go together.*
- *No objections with the proposal conceptually.*

Commissioner Ours:

- *Thinks the proposal looks great, conceptually.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

14. 17-12-26 (not required to attend)

199 East Deshler Avenue

Sally S. Levy (Applicant/Owner)

An application and photographs have been submitted.

Build New Fence

- Rebuild section of 6’ high privacy fence, facing onto Deshler Avenue.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:55 P.M.

15. 17-12-27

292 East Sycamore Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Jill Shin (Owner)

An application, drawings, and photographs have been submitted. A two-story, rear addition was approved and built in 2014.

Install New Awning

- Install a new, 17’ wide x 14’ deep, retractable, projecting awning on the rear of the two story dwelling, per the submitted photos and drawings.

16. 17-12-28

359 Jackson Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Bruce & Mary Caldwell (Owners)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing. An application, site plan, photos, and revised elevation drawings have been submitted.

New Addition

- Expand existing, rear addition along the west elevation on the first floor.
- Add second floor above existing, rear, one-story addition, per the submitted drawings.
- Eaves of new addition to line up with existing structure.
- A shed dormer with one window opening to be on the west slope of the roof.
- A shed dormer with three window openings to be on the east slope of the roof.
- Install new siding on the existing first story, to match siding on the second story addition.
- Install new, wood trim on existing, first story window opening on east elevation.
- Foundation to be split-face block to match existing addition.
- Exterior siding to be Boral, 1 x8, flush shiplap.
- Cut sheets for new, Lincoln wood doors and windows to be submitted to HPO staff.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingles from the approved roofing shingles list.
- Exterior paint colors to match existing colors on main structure.

The following is from the November 8, 2017 GVC hearing:

Commissioner Ours:

- *The eave line appears on the drawing to be significantly higher than the principle house.*
- *Is more concerned about the north elevation. If it could be lower, that would be better.*
- *There should be a change in siding materials and simplification of casings to differentiate between old and new.*
- *There has to be a gap between the existing and new, or else there is no connector.*
- *If the roof form of the addition is really different than the main house, the siding should also be really different.*
- *A jerkinhead/clipped gable roof could be more appropriate than a full hipped roof.*

Commissioner Ferriell:

- *No additional comments.*

Commissioner Thiell:

- *The entire roof needs to come down in height.*
- *There is no relationship between the two roofs. Consider a hipped roof.*

Commissioner Durst:

- *Likes the idea of making the addition a hipped roof. It decreases the gap.*

Commissioner Panzer:

- *The eave on the far west section needs to come down.*
- *Nickel gap Boral siding could be appropriate.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

17. 17-12-28

179 East Deshler Avenue

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Chip Burke (Owner)

Removal of an existing pergola, and construction of a new, open, rear porch on the ca. 2000, brick dwelling was approved at the September 5, 2017 GVC hearing. An application, site plan, photos, and revised elevation drawings have been submitted.

New Rear Porch/Solarium (south elevation)

- Construct a new, enclosed porch on the rear elevation of the ca. 2000, two-story, brick dwelling, per the submitted drawings.
- Windows and doors to be Marvin, custom made, aluminum-clad, wood.
- Alter existing, stucco chimney to accommodate a new fireplace flue. Size to be 28" x 48".

Install New Front Entrance Doors (north elevation)

- Remove three (3) existing French doors on rear elevation and install new, custom French doors, per the submitted drawing.
- Remove the existing, main entry, double doors, and install new, custom made double doors, per the submitted drawing.
- New doors to be two-panel, stained mahogany with panel mold.

Install New Windows

- Remove all existing (12 total) windows on all elevations.
- Install new, Marvin, aluminum-clad wood, 2/2 double-hung sash windows with 2" flat casings.
- Window sizes to match existing openings.

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants are not required to attend)

• **17-12-1**

607-609 City Park Avenue

Gayle Rosen (Applicant)

Josh Grosshandler (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-1, 607-609 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Asphalt Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated asphalt shingles on the main, hipped roof of the house with new shingles, to match existing, in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.
- Remove existing rubber or rolled roofing on the flat portion of the hipped roof, and install new rubber roofing, as needed.
- Replace metal ridge roll and flashing at chimneys, as needed.

• **17-12-2**

849 Mohawk Street

Craig A. Colvin (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 17-12-2, 849 Mohawk Street, for renewal of expired COA # 16-4-5a (Expired: March 24, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Re-install

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, brick public sidewalk, and set aside intact brick pavers. Dispose of all debris and unsalvageable bricks in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Level underlying soil to create a flat even surface and relay sidewalk over compacted sand base, using existing brick pavers, in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension and bond pattern (herringbone) as existing. Any damaged brick pavers are to be replaced with new brick pavers to match existing in color, size and texture as closely as possible.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications and paint with appropriate exterior paint. Paint color for finish coat is to be Sherwin Williams "Intellectual Gray" (SW 7045) for the trim and rear siding, and black semi-gloss for the front door.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **17-12-3**

738 South Sixth Street

Tracy Cohen/Superior Home Management (Applicant)

Justin Himler & Mona Adeli (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-3, 738 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code. Front porch roof not being reroofed at this time.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **17-12-4**

475 South Third Street

Metropolitan G.V., LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-4, 475 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Temporary Sign

- Retain the one (1) existing, single-faced, “for lease” sign, on the existing fence, facing toward Livingston Avenue.
- Sign material is .5” thick MDO duraply panel, filled, primed, and painted with exterior grade enamels.
- Graphics are high performance vinyl, applied directly to panel.
- Sign measures 3’9” x 7’6” (28.13 sq. ft.).
- Sign secured to fence with four (4) pipe post brackets.
- Lease sign includes company name and contact information and type of space to be leased, and does not include the address of any property to be leased.
- Approval is for a ninety (90) day extension of the original COA#17-9-12, issued August 7, 2017.
- Temporary sign to be removed no later than ninety (90) days following the issuance of this Certificate of Appropriateness (Feb 2, 2018). Any additional requests for extension to be reviewed by the German Village Commission.

- **17-12-5**

260 Lansing Street

Brian Suiter (Applicant)

Brian & Eve Suiter (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-5, 260 Lansing Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Landscape/Hardscape

- Remove existing brick pavers and plantings in rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, concrete paver patio in rear yard, per the submitted site plan and material sample. All pavers to be installed in a manner to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.
- Install new, concrete paver path along east side of house, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new plantings along the east side of the existing garage, per the submitted site plan and plantings list.
- Install new, wood stairs at the rear of the house, per the submitted plan.
- Install new lounge seating area, per the submitted plan.
- Install new, slatted trellis fence for herb pots, per the submitted plan.
- Install additional plantings and furnishings, as per the submitted plan.

- **17-12-6**

595 South Fifth Street

Thomas E. Gibson (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-6, 595 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffits and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair Windows

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

Repair Porch Flooring

- Remove all damaged and deteriorated flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Replace with new, tongue and groove, yellow pine, porch flooring of same dimensions as existing.
- Match existing flooring overhang. If applicable, match all damaged and deteriorated barge molding with new material of same dimension and profile.

- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Prime new flooring on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat entire porch floor with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications and paint with appropriate exterior paint. Paint color chips to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Tuck Pointing

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Repair/replace flashing at rear garage addition, as needed.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Repair Masonry Chimneys

- Tuck point the six (6) existing chimneys, and install new, stone caps, as needed, per the submitted work order description.
- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Reinstall Existing Gutters

- Following all eave repair/replacement, priming, and finish coating, reinstall all existing metal gutters and metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage, per the submitted work order description.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **17-12-7**

360-362-362 ½ Jackson Street

Edward J. Merkle (Applicant)

Edward J. & Jo Anne Merkle (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-6, 360-362-362 ½ Jackson Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **17-12-8b**

175 East Deshler Avenue

Able Roof (Applicant)

Larry Little (Owner)

Application #17-12-8 has been divided into item 'a' for German Village Commission review under New Applications (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application #17-12-8b, 175 East Deshler Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Slate Roof/Carriage House

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate (approximately 10) on the main roof with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

Repair Asphalt Shingle Roof/House

- Complete general repairs to the existing, asphalt shingle roof on the main roof of the house, including nail pops, loose shingles and flashing, etc. as needed.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the small, one-story bump-out on the rear elevation, per the submitted photos, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia and trim with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia and trim prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Repair Masonry Chimneys

- Tuck point two (2) existing chimneys, per the submitted work order description.
- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

• **17-12-9**

245 Jackson Street

Brad Bushman (Applicant) Brad Bushman & Tamara Rae Stafford (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-9, 245 Jackson Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof of the house with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

• **17-12-10**

850 South Fifth Street

Bello Giardino Landscape (Applicant) Sallie Sherman (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-10, 850 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Landscape/Hardscape

- Remove existing brick pavers in rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Relay existing pavers in same location in rear yard, per the submitted photographs. All pavers to be installed in a manner to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

• **17-12-11**

793 South Third Street

John & Heidi Drake (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-11, 793 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Refinish Doors

- Remove existing finish on the two, wood front entrance doors.
- Sand and apply new stain and polyurethane finish. Stain color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the file.
- Door on south to be removed for refinishing, and temporary plywood cover installed.
- Door on north to be refinished in place.
- Reinstall all existing hardware.

• **17-12-12**

1058 South Pearl Street

Keith Melaragno (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-12, 1058 South Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Retain the existing paint color scheme on the existing, exterior vinyl siding, as applied prior to review and approval.
- Existing body color is Sherwin Williams "Naval," (SW6244). Trim is White.

New Flower Boxes

- Retain the existing, wood flower boxes, as installed prior to review and approval.

- Any/all future exterior work on the building or site requires a Historic Commission Review Application and approval prior to beginning work, per C.C. 3116.04.

- **17-12-13**

743 Jaeger Street

Mary Connolly Ross (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-13, 743 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install Stair Handrail/Front Entrance

- Prior to the installation of the new handrail, examine the existing, brick front entrance steps and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.
- Install a new, black metal handrail on front entrance steps in accordance with all applicable Columbus Building Codes
- Style of handrail to be Fortin "DOOR-2," per the submitted product cut sheet. Color to be "Black."
- Handrail to be attached to brick treads of the steps.

- **17-12-14**

290 East Sycamore Street

Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

David Schooler (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-14, 290 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Landscape/Hardscape

- Install a new, sandstone patio in the rear yard of the new, single-family dwelling, per the submitted site plan. All pavers to be installed in a manner to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.
- Install new, 18" high, limestone seat wall in rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new, 48" high, vertical trellis to screen AC condenser unit. Trellis to match existing 48" high fence.
- Install new, planters and plantings, per the submitted site plan and plants list.

- **17-12-15**

1090 City Park Avenue

Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

Leslie Malcoff (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-15, 1090 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Landscape/Hardscape

- Install a new, sandstone patio in the rear yard of the new, single-family dwelling, per the submitted site plan. All pavers to be installed in a manner to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.
- Install new, 18" high, limestone seat wall in rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new, 6' high, accent trellis, per the submitted site plan. Trellis to be made of cedar and painted.
- Install new, planter pots and plantings, per the submitted site plan and plants list.

- **17-12-17**

791 South Lazelle Street

Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)

Tom Bray (Owner)

Approve Application #17-12-17, 791 South Lazelle Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove the two (2), existing, non-original, non-contributing windows near the rear of the south elevation, per the submitted photographs.
- Install two (2) new, Marvin Wood Ultimate, two-over-one, double-hung windows in same location, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications. Color to match existing windows.
- New windows are to fit within the historic window openings.

• **17-12-19b**

710 South Pearl Street

Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

Terry & Shelly Kelley (Owner)

Application #17-12-19 has been divided into item 'a' for German Village Commission review under Staff Recommendations (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application #17-12-19b, 710 South Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Brick Sidewalk

- Remove the existing, concrete, public sidewalk located in front of the property, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new paving bricks in the same pattern as the existing brick, public sidewalk to the north. New sidewalk dimensions to match existing.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Install new or used sandstone curbing, like-for-like, in accordance with Columbus City Code and in consultation with the Department of Public Service.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install a new six-foot high (6' H), wood privacy fence along the north, south, and east property lines of the newly constructed dwelling, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence with finished side out, facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

• **17-12-22b**

538 South Sixth Street

Steven R. Maravich, ASLA (Applicant)

Michele Holcomb (Owner)

Application #17-12-22 has been divided into item 'a' for German Village Commission review under New Applications (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application #17-12-22b, 538 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

New Patio and Walkway

- Remove the existing, clay paver patio and fire pit in the rear yard, per the submitted photographs
- Remove existing, concrete walkway along south side of house.
- Install new, 1" thick, Banas slate gray sandstone patio and walkway, per the submitted site plan. Sandstone pavers to be installed on 6" compacted gravel base, with polymeric sand swept into joints.
- All pavers to be installed in a manner to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

Flagstone Seating Area

- Install a new, flagstone seating area at the northeast corner of the property, per the submitted site plan.

Install New Steps

- Remove the existing, brick steps at the two (2) rear entrance doors, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, limestone stoops/steps at the two (2) rear entrance doors, per the submitted site plan and example photograph.
- Install new, black, wrought iron handrail at steps, per the submitted drawing.

Install new Retaining Wall

- Remove the existing, stone retaining walls and steps at the southeast corner of the property in the rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, retaining walls in same location. Walls to be Ottawa Rustic Buff Smooth Limestone with 3" limestone cap.

Modify Existing Brick Walls

- Lower the height of the two (2), existing sections of brick wall that extend from the rear elevation of the house, per the submitted photographs.
- Westernmost wall to be lowered to 20” above the stoop elevation. Easternmost wall to be lowered to 36” above grade to create an outdoor bar with granite counter, per the submitted drawing.

New Plantings

- Remove the existing yew hedge near the garage. Remove three (3) lilac shrubs. Cut back ivy on existing brick wall along Blenkner Street.
- Install new ornamental tree at northeast corner of property, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new planting beds, per the submitted site plan.

• **17-12-29**

203 East Sycamore Street

Michele Lavon (Applicant)

Michele & Dan Lavon (Owners)

Approve Application #17-12-29, 203 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair/Replace Fence

- Remove the existing wood privacy fence along S. Fifth Street, and install a new six-foot high (6’ H), wood privacy fence in the same location, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6’ H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence with finished side out, facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6’ H), straight-cut (not dog-eared or stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-foot high (6’ H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- BOCA Hearing, November 15, 2017
Results as follows:

After consideration of the testimony regarding the property located at 210-220 Thurman Avenue in the German Village Historic District, approve the appeal of the denial of Application #17-8-14 on the basis that the German Village Commission’s decision to deny the application was arbitrary, capricious, and unreasonable pursuant to the rehearing process outlined in City Code Chapter 3116.

MOTION: Vogt/Farrell (4-1-0) [Bass] APPROVED—APPEAL UPHOLD

Upon review by the Board of Commission Appeals at the November 15, 2017 Hearing, the German Village Commission is directed to issue Certificate of Appropriateness #17-8-23, 210-220 Thurman Avenue, for the work as indicated and in accordance with City Code Chapters 3116 & 3118 and pursuant to the provisions of Chapter 3118 and the standards of criteria per Chapter 3116 of Columbus City Code.

COA has been issued for dumpster enclosure as presented at the August 1, 2017 GVC hearing.

XII. ADJOURNMENT