

## GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, January 7, 2020  
4:00 p.m.  
111 N. Front Street, Room 204

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email [zdjones@columbus.gov](mailto:zdjones@columbus.gov), at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, January 28, 2020 – 111 North Front Street, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, February 4, 2020 – 111 N. Front St., 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Room 204
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, December 3, 2019
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. APPROVAL OF STAFF APPROVALS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

### STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

1. **GV-20-01-010** (*not required to attend*)  
282 East Sycamore Street  
Thomas L. & Kathryn L. Brod
  - MOVED TO STAFF APPROVAL

### CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

### IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:05 P.M.

2. **GV-19-12-023** (*attending*)  
324 Jackson St.  
Brenda Parker (Applicant)/ Shannon Keeran (Owner)  
*This application was reviewed at and continued from the December 3, 2029 GVC hearing.*
  - Construct new, 20' deep by 18'9" wide, 2-story rear addition over crawl space at rear of house with balcony.
  - Addition set back from main house by 8" on west and 18" on the east.
  - Replace siding and windows on existing east and west dormers, and include new door to access balcony.
  - Replace existing vinyl window in front living room with new wood window, and restore bricked-in window opening with new sandstone header & sill to match existing.
  - Raise roof height on existing (6'-0" H) garage to allow for an 8' garage door height. Exterior to be brick with CMU backup.

*The following is from the December 3, 2029 GVC hearing minutes:*  
Commissioner Comments:



- *Overhang on addition is proposed at about 9” and is into the 3-foot zone. Don’t think Zoning staff will approve any overhang, and GVC would not allow not to have an overhang of at least 9”. Clarify these issues with Zoning.*
- *Applicant noted that the wall is already fire rated.*
- *The brick and mortar on the house need to match exactly.*
- *Consider CHI garage doors.*
- *Consider the effect of a deck/balcony on neighboring properties.*
- *Do not think the GVC has approved the Integrity Wood Ultrex (now Elevate) on historic buildings or additions to historic buildings.*

*MOTION: Theill/Durst (5-0-2[McCoy & Hartke- recused]) CONTINUED*

## **NEW APPLICATIONS**

### **IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:15 P.M.**

#### **3. GV-20-01-011 (attending)**

**862 South Third Street**

**Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Sabrena Noria (Owner)**

*This application was conceptually reviewed September 2019. An application, photos, and drawings have been submitted.*

Rear Addition / House

- Remove existing second floor balcony.
- Build two-story rear addition, per submitted drawings.
- Horizontal siding to match existing rear addition.
- Asphalt roofing shingles to match existing.
- South slope of roof to include one skylight.
- Cut sheets for all windows and detail drawing of balcony railings to be submitted.
- Proposed in-ground pool and terrace to be a separate application.

Addition / Garage

- Remove existing rear wall on the existing concrete block garage.
- Build new, 14-foot frame extension on west elevation, per submitted drawings.
- Cut sheets for all windows and doors to be submitted.

*The following is from the September, 2019 GVC hearing:*

Commissioners Comments:

- *The Commission questioned whether the proposed addition can be constructed, as shown, given the (small) distance to the property line. The Commission noted that they would not be supportive of an addition without eaves.*
- *The Commission clarified that the proposal is to extrude out the back 2-story mass with a flat roof, on top.*
- *When the application returns for final review, the Commission requested existing elevations (for comparison), a demolition plan, and a roof plan.*
- *Discussion regarding existing garage. Commission supported keeping the garage and did not have objections to the proposed addition/modifications.*

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:25 P.M.**

**4. GV-20-01-012 (CONCEPTUAL)**

**738-742 Jaeger Street**

**Juliett Bullock (Applicant)**

*An application to demolish the ca. 1924 garage was conceptually reviewed April 2 and May 7, 2019. Five Commissioners have conducted site a site visit. An application, photos, and drawings have been submitted.*

Demolition

- Demolish the existing ca. 1924, concrete block, three-car garage.

New Garage with Office Space

- Build a new, two-car garage, per submitted drawings.
- Exterior to be concrete block and wood siding (4 1/2" exposure).
- Clad windows and asphalt roofing to be from approved lists.

*The following is from the May 7, 2019 GVC minutes:*

Commissioner Comments

- *The Commissioners noted that following the previous Concept Review, five (5) Commissioners made staff coordinated site visits to view the garage in person (two Commissioners on 4/11/19 and three Commissioners on 4/12/19).*
- *One Commissioner who visited the site was unsupportive, noting that the contributing structure needs maintenance-not demolition.*
- *Another Commissioner who visited the site and was opposed to demolition outright, noted that a hardship appeal (assuming demolition is denied and appealed) may be supportable, given the condition of the structure (separating of masonry block visible on all four walls). The Commissioner reasoned that complete dismantling of the structure would likely be required in order to repair the structure.*
- *Another Commissioner who visited the site opined that the only way to save the structure appears to be to tear it apart piece by piece. The Commissioner noted that of the contributing structures in the Village, this one is contributing, but right on the margin.*
- *Another Commissioner who visited the site noted that the structure appears to be salvageable, but is right on the line. The Commissioner opined that the reality is that this garage and others like it were built with shallow footers 60/80/100 years ago, and they're still standing. The ones in bad condition are in bad condition because they have been poorly maintained. This structure does not appear to be in imminent danger of collapsing. The Commissioner noted that they would not be in favor of building a new carriage house with an increased setback, off of the alley; however, replacing it in-kind with pressed block and extending it into the yard area (to increase the depth but maintain the setback from the alley and the roof height) would be supportable.*
- *One Commissioner noted that they were opposed to a replication with a new floorplan. The Commissioner in support of the increased depth noted that the distinction would be that it's extending into a rear yard that is outside of/hidden from public view.*
- *In order to increase the door height (to accommodate the applicant's truck), the Commissioners recommended looking at the materials used for the lentils and/or low-rise openers (suggested by the applicant), noting that they would not be supportive of increasing the overall/ridge height.*

**NO ACTION TAKEN**

**IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:40 P.M.**

**5. GV-20-01-013 (attending)**

**31-35 E Livingston Avenue**

**Moody Nolan, Inc. (Applicant)/ Wickford Holdings, LLC (Owner)**

*An application, photos, a material board and conceptual drawings have been submitted. A hotel has been conceptually reviewed by the GVC several times in 2018 and 2019. Applicant requests Action to be taken on the following items:*

Demolition - Office Building / 31-35 E. Livingston Ave.

- Demolish an existing, ca. 1942, one-story office building at 31-35 E. Livingston Avenue.

New Construction

- Construct a four-story hotel on E. Livingston Avenue, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior materials to include stainless steel metal tile, decorative perforated metal panels, wood panels, and brick in shades of red and gray, per the submitted product cut sheets.
- Windows to be steel Graham SR6700 Series, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Construct below grade parking (135 spaces) with a courtyard plaza and green space cap. Access to underground parking to be from Blenkner Street.

Demolition - Rear Addition / 485-489 City Park Ave.

- Demolish the existing 1969 concrete block rear addition.
- Remove two non-original dormers on cottage.
- Remove non-original awnings and fence.

Renovate Cottage / New Connector

- Restore original window openings on façade, per historic drawings.
- Replace existing windows and doors.
- Replace existing door (north elevation) with window in non-original brick wall (where recessed porch existed).
- Create new door opening (north elevation) in non-original brick wall.
- Install new front and side doors (simulated divided lite).
- Install new slate shingles from approved roofing materials list.
- Build new connector to new hotel. Roof to be lower than cottage roof. Wall facing City Park Avenue to be “green.”

Request for Variance Recommendation

1). Section 3309.14, Height Districts, to permit a 55'-0" tall building in the H-35 Height District.

2). Section 3312.53, Minimum Number of Loading Spaces Required, to reduce loading spaces, as defined, from one (1) space to zero (0) spaces.

3). Section 3356.11(A)(2), C-4 District Setback Lines, to reduce the E. Livingston Avenue building setback line, based on the Columbus Thoroughfare Plan (CTP), from 30 feet to 0 feet.

*The following is from the October 1, 2019 GVC hearing:*

Commissioner Comments:

- *Requested breakdown of parking (e.g., required spaces vs. proposed spaces) and better understanding of existing parking agreements that may be affected.*
- *Questioned if trees could survive in courtyard over parking structure or if any/all trees within the courtyard would be potted/in planters.*
- *Questioned feasibility of a hotel, on this property, if all zoning and parking requirements were met. Further questioned if a height variance is required, to make a hotel economically viable, at this location?*
- *One Commissioner was concerned that rooftop/balcony spaces may be converted to outdoor bar space by a future tenant, without having to return to the Commission. Applicant indicated that as proposed, Code would require exterior changes (triggering Commission review), if a future tenant wanted to create a rooftop bar space.*
- *Commissioner discussion about whether the Guidelines intend for development adjacent to the historic district to be considered. Commissioner consensus that buildings outside of the boundaries of the district are not to be taken*

*under consideration. Further discussion about park boundaries (e.g., Central Park in NYC) and new development proposed at the inside edge of the district not being looked at any differently from new development proposed within the interior of the district.*

- *Commissioner discussion about importance of development along interior edges of district being compatible with and reflective of what is found interior to the district- edges are first chance to experience district, where district announces itself, etc.*
- *Commissioners present were not supportive of proposed height, given that it would exceed the height of the surrounding building, located within the historic district.*
- *Two Commissioners noted opposition to proposed massing.*

**NO ACTION TAKEN**

### **STAFF APPROVALS**

*(The following applicants are not required to attend)*

- **GV-20-01-001**  
**182 Thurman Ave.**  
**James Todd Pershing (Owner)**  
Approve Application #GV-20-01-001, 182 Thurman Ave., as submitted, with all clarifications noted.
  - Remove approximately 160' of existing fence on east and west side of backyard.
  - Replace fence with a cedar fence matching the remaining 60' of existing fence, per submitted materials.
  - Fence to be sealed in the spring of 2020.Install New Privacy Fence
  - Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- **GV-20-01-002**  
**541 S Lazelle Street**  
**Bello Giardino (Applicant)/ Robert Milnes (Owner)**  
Approve Application GV-20-01-002, 541 S Lazelle Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.
  - Remove side rear masonry wall (north side of property)Install New Privacy Fence
  - Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted Peppercorn SW7674 and/ or Black magic SW6991 within one (1) year.
- **GV-20-01-003**  
**163-169 E. Beck St.**  
**DeMarco Inc. (Applicant)**  
Approve Application GV-20-01-003, 163-169 E. Beck St. for renewal of expired COA # 18-9-37 (Expired: August 28, 2019), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.  
Repair Box Gutters
  - Repair existing box gutters, per the submitted specifications.
  - Examine all box gutters on the main house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
  - Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
  - Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
  - Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
  - Replacement of shingles must match existing shingles.

- **GV-20-01-004**

**597-601 Mohawk St.**

**DeMarco Inc. (Applicant)**

Approve Application GV-20-01-04, 597-601 Mohawk St. for renewal of expired COA # 18-9-39 (Expired: August 28, 2019), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Repair Box Gutters

- Repair existing box gutters, per the submitted specifications.
- Examine all box gutters on the main house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- Replacement of shingles must match existing shingles

STAFF APPROVED

- **GV-20-01-005**

**593-595 Mohawk St.**

**DeMarco Inc. (Applicant)**

Approve Application GV-20-01-005, 593-595 Mohawk St. for renewal of expired COA # 18-9-38 (Expired: August 28, 2019), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Repair Box Gutters

- Repair existing box gutters, per the submitted specifications.
- Examine all box gutters on the main house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- Replacement of shingles must match existing shingles

STAFF APPROVED

- **GV-20-01-006**

**823 S. Third St.**

**Greg Powers Contractors (Applicant), KJLO Properties, LLC (Owner)**

Approve Application GV-20-01-006, 823 S. Third St., as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair Masonry Wall

- Remove any/all damaged material and replace with like-for-like materials as indicated by checked box. Replacement **[X]brick** [ ]block and/or [ ]stone to match existing in size, color, and shape. Mortar to match existing mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust

For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings” supplied by staff.)

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **GV-20-01-007**

**322 E. Beck St.**

**Bello Giardino (Applicant), Mr. Manring (Owner)**

Approve Application GV-20-01-007, 322 E. Beck St., as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove Existing Curb Section and Install New

- Remove the existing, deteriorated concrete curb section and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install a new, concrete curb section of the exact same size and dimension as the existing in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards; like-for-like.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, brick public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new brick in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

• **GV-20-01-008**

**827 City Park Avenue**

**Evan Sauer (Applicant)/ Evan and Kimberley Sauer (Owner)**

Approve Application GV-20-01-008, 827 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new solid limestone steps and existing clay brick pavers per the paver detail in the approved plan.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Install New Address Plaque

- Install rubbed bronzed two line address plaque on front of house, replacing old address numbers.

Replace Exterior Window Boxes

- Replace and install 3 window boxes on the front windows of the cottage. All cedar (non-painted or stained). Two 48 inch window boxes for the lower windows and one 36 inch window box for the top (see photos).

- **GV-20-01-009**  
**595 South Third Street**  
**Greg Kitzmiller (Applicant)/ Mohawk Properties, LLC. (Owner)**  
Approve Application GV-20-01-009, 595 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.  
New Projecting Sign
    - Install one (1) new, routed, non-illuminated, double-sided, high density urethane logo sign with tag line, per the submitted drawings.
    - Sign face to be approximately 28.75” H x 30.25” W (6.04 sf).
  
  - **GV-20-01-010**  
**282 East Sycamore Street**  
**Thomas L. & Kathryn L. Brod**  
Approve Application GV-20-01-010, 282 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.  
New Transom Window
    - Remove the existing clear glass in the existing transom, and install new clear, beveled and leaded glass, per the submitted drawing.
- X.** NEW BUSINESS
- XI.** OLD BUSINESS
- XII.** ADJOURNMENT